

Message

---

**From:** Hough, Palmer [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=51CD0B0D81AC416FA265944D6E6575CE-PHOUGH]  
**Sent:** 9/3/2013 9:28:27 PM  
**To:** Daniel Schindler [deschind@uw.edu]  
**Subject:** RE: Questions regarding EPA citations to Schindler, 2010

Dan:

I hope you are well. Just checking in to see if you have had time to think about this issue.

Thanks, Palmer

---

Palmer Hough, Environmental Scientist  
office: 202.566.1374 | mobile: 202.657.3114

Wetlands Division  
U.S. EPA Headquarters (MC 4502T)  
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20460  
[www.epa.gov/wetlands](http://www.epa.gov/wetlands)

**From:** Daniel Schindler [mailto:deschind@uw.edu]  
**Sent:** Thursday, August 15, 2013 7:35 PM  
**To:** Hough, Palmer  
**Subject:** Re: Questions regarding EPA citations to Schindler, 2010

Hi Palmer,

I am happy to provide you some thoughts about this. The sentence they have pulled out of our paper is from the Introduction (I think) of our paper that motivates the results that we then show later in the paper. I will send you some specific feedback.

Cheers,  
Daniel

On Thu, Aug 15, 2013 at 1:44 PM, Hough, Palmer <[Hough.Palmer@epa.gov](mailto:Hough.Palmer@epa.gov)> wrote:

Dan:

I hope you are well. I appreciated your coming in to meet with folks here at EPA HQ earlier this year regarding our Bristol Bay Assessment (BBA). We are currently reviewing the over 885,000 public comments we received on the April 2013 revised draft BBA. Among these comments is a report prepared for the Pebble Limited Partnership by the HDR consulting firm. Among other things, the HDR report questions our citation to your 2010 publication

(Schindler, D.E., R. Hilborn, B. Chasco, C.P. Boatright, T.P. Quinn, L.A. Rogers, and M.S. Webster. 2010. Population diversity and the portfolio effect in an exploited species. Nature 465: 609-612.).

The attached word file has the two excerpts from Appendix J of the April 2013 BBA that refer to Schindler 2010 and that HDR calls into question. This word file also includes HDR's specific comments regarding these two excerpts. I would appreciate your thoughts regarding whether or not you think these citations by EPA to your 2010 publication are appropriate. I have also attached a complete copy of Appendix J of the April 2013 BBA as well as a copy of the complete report prepared by HDR for the Pebble Limited Partnership in case you would like to see either of these.

Thank you for any insights you can share regarding this issue and please do not hesitate to contact me if you have any questions.

Thanks, Palmer

---

Palmer Hough, Environmental Scientist  
office: [202.566.1374](tel:202.566.1374) | mobile: [202.657.3114](tel:202.657.3114)

Wetlands Division  
U.S. EPA Headquarters (MC 4502T)  
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20460  
[www.epa.gov/wetlands](http://www.epa.gov/wetlands)